PensionBenefits, Inc.

## RTA Employees' Defined Benefit Plan & Trust

## Actuarial Valuation Report as of January 1, 2016 for the Plan Year Ending December 31, 2016

May 2016

Prepared by:

PensionBenefits, Inc. 700 E. Park Blvd. Suite 108 Plano, TX 75074 972.424.2230



May 19, 2016

Ms. Cindy O'Brien Finance Director Regional Transportation Authority 5658 Bear Lane Corpus Christi, TX 78405

# Re: Actuarial Valuation of the *RTA Employees' Defined Benefit Plan & Trust* as of January 1, 2016

Dear Cindy:

We are pleased to present our Report of the actuarial valuation of the *RTA Employees' Defined Benefit Plan & Trust* as of January 1, 2016.

In additional to the actuarial valuation results, various accounting and employee listings are also included which should help you compare this plan year with prior years.

Based upon the actuarial valuation as of January 1, 2016, it is our opinion that the *RTA Employees' Defined Benefits Plan & Trust* is actuarially sound and that these results reasonably reflect the funding status and requirements of the plan. The assumptions and methods used in the actuarial valuation are reasonable and appropriate.

We would like to thank you for your assistance in providing all necessary data to complete this valuation. Please do not hesitate to let us know if you have any questions or need additional information.

Sincerely,

Kien Liew, EA, FCA, MAAA Senior Actuary Mark A. Cavazos, ASA Manager, Pension Services

## **EXECUTIVE HIGHLIGHTS**

- 1. The target long-term sustainability goal is 9.4% of compensation as discussed in Section 2.2 of the 2011 Report on Retirement Benefits.
- 2015 Normal Cost increased to 10.3% of payroll (v. 9.9% for 2015). Normal cost represents the annual cost of providing an additional year of pension benefits (2% of average compensation) for the active participants. This is the only cost each year if the plan does not have any unfunded liability.
- 3. The 2015 annual contribution increased to 16.0% of payroll (v. 11.2% for 2015). The annual contribution is the sum of the Normal Cost plus the Amortization Payment of the unfunded liability. The increase in the contribution is mainly due to the investment losses and higher than expected pay increases during 2015.
- 4. The key to reduce contribution volatility is to identify the volatility risks and proactively manage these risks. These were discussed in the 2011 Report on Retirement Benefits. Long term sustainability of the pension plan relies on how the risks are managed.

While short-term volatility of investment return and other actuarial gains or losses is expected, we will continue to monitor the actuarial assumptions used and recommend appropriate adjustment when necessary.

## CONTENTS

Section		Page
	Transmittal Letter	
	Executive Highlights	i
	Table of Contents	
1.	Executive Summary	1
2.	Introduction	2
3.	Effect of Plan Amendment	3
4.	Annual Contribution Amount	4
5.	Plan Assets	6
6.	Actuarial Gains and Losses	9
7.	GASB Nos. 67 and 68 Disclosure	14
8.	Summary and Closing Comments	22
9.	Plan Specifications	23
10.	Demographic Data	26
11.	Schedule of Benefits	74

#### Section 1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The key results from the actuarial valuation of the RTA Employees' Defined Benefit Plan as of January 1, 2016, may be summarized as follows:

		2016	2015
1.	Participants a. Actives b. Deferred Vested c. Retirees & Beneficiaries d. Total	223 175 <u>140</u> 538	232 164 <u>129</u> 525
2.	Covered Payroll	\$9,178,411	\$8,818,232
3.	Normal Cost (NC) Percent of covered payroll	\$941,470 10.3%	\$876,806 9.9%
4.	Present Value of Future Benefits	\$39,756,092	\$37,913,504
5.	Actuarial Accrued Liability	\$33,530,870	\$31,895,409
6.	Actuarial Asset Value	\$30,210,461	\$31,162,434
7.	Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability (UAAL)	\$3,320,409	\$732,975
8.	Actuarial Assets as percent of Accrued Liability	90.1%	97.7%
9.	Actuarial Gains/(Losses) a. Due to actual experience b. Due to assumption/method change c. Due to plan amendment d. Total	(\$2,520,103) N/A (\$115,478) (\$2,635,581)	(\$1,502,296) N/A (\$391,915) (\$1,894,211)
10.	Annual Contribution Amount (assumed contribution on January 1): Percent of covered payroll	\$1,468,804 16.0%	\$983,696 11.2%
11.	Investment return assumption	7.5%	7.5%
12.	Salary increase assumption	3.5%	3.5%

#### Section 2. INTRODUCTION

This January 1, 2016 actuarial valuation of the RTA Employees' Defined Benefit Plan has been prepared by PensionBenefits, Inc. The primary purpose of the valuation is to value the liabilities of the plan as of January 1, 2016, determine the RTA's contribution, and to provide certain disclosure information.

Section 1 provides a summary of the valuation results. Section 3 shows the effect of the early retirement window. Section 4 shows the development of the annual contribution amount. Assets are discussed in Section 5. Section 6 contains an analysis of the actuarial gains and losses during the past year.

Government Accounting Standards Board Statement (GASB) Nos. 67 and 68 information in the report is discussed in Section 7. Section 8 summarizes our findings.

Section 9 summarizes the plan provisions and actuarial assumptions used in the valuation. Sections 10 and 11 list census data and benefits.

#### Section 3. EFFECT OF PLAN AMENDMENT

This year's valuation reflects the ad hoc cost-of-living increase effective January 1, 2016 for participants who are receiving pension payments:

- Five percent (5%) for participants whose benefits began as of January 1, 2005.
- Two percent (2%) for participants whose benefits began between January 1, 2010 and January 1, 2005.

The effect of these changes on key results is summarized below:

	After Plan Amendment	Prior to Plan Amendment	Increase / (Decrease)
Covered Payroll	\$9,178,411	\$9,178,411	\$0
Normal Cost	941,470	941,470	0
Actuarial Accrued Liability	33,530,870	33,415,392	115,478
Actuarial Asset Value	30,210,461	30,210,461	0
Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability	3,320,409	3,204,931	115,478
Annual Contribution Amount (assumed contribution at January 1)	1,468,804	1,450,464	18,340
Percent of Covered Payroll	16.0%	15.8%	0.2%

## Section 4. ANNUAL CONTRIBUTION AMOUNT

The annual contribution amount is the normal cost plus the amortization of the unfunded actuarial liability as a level dollar amount over 15 years from January 1, 2009 (8 years remain). This is the same approach as used in the prior year.

The normal cost and actuarial accrued liability are developed based on the entry-agenormal (EAN) actuarial cost method.

Section 4.1 Development of Annual Contribution Amount

#### Section 4.1 DEVELOPMENT OF ANNUAL CONTRIBUTION AMOUNT

1.	Normal Cost (NC)	\$	941,470
2.	Amortization Amount a. Unfunded Accrued Liability (UAAL) b. Number of years remaining on	\$ 3,320,409	527,334
	<ul><li>15-year amortization starting 1/1/2009</li><li>c. Amortization factor</li><li>d. Amortization amount (a / c)</li></ul>	8 6.2966 527,334	
3.	Annual Contribution Amount at 1/1/2016: (1 + 2)	\$ 1	,468,804*

\* Contribution payable on January 1, 2016. All amounts outstanding shall accrue interest at a rate of 7.5% per annum until paid.

#### Section 5. PLAN ASSETS

An analysis of the change in the Plan assets since the prior valuation and an estimate of the yield on assets for the Plan are included in section 5.1.

- Section 5.1 Change in Assets
- Section 5.2 Description of Assets

## Section 5.1: CHANGE IN ASSETS

Occile		N	Market Value		
1.	Plan assets as of January 1, 2015	\$	31,162,434		
2.	Employer contributions		985,175		
3.	Benefit payments made		1,493,324		
4.	Expenses paid from trust		94,874		
5.	Investment return		(348,950)		
6.	Plan assets as of December 31, 2015 (1+2–3–4+5)	\$	30,210,461		
7.	Dollar-weighted rate of return <sup>1</sup> a. Average invested assets: b. Actual rate of return: [(5 – 4) / 7a]	\$	31,150,987 (1.42%)		
8.	<ul> <li>Actuarial asset gain (loss)</li> <li>a. Expected rate of return</li> <li>b. Expected net investment return: [7a × 8a]</li> <li>c. Actual net investment return: [5 – 4]</li> <li>d. Actuarial asset gain (loss): [8c – 8b]</li> </ul>	\$ (\$ (\$	7.50% 2,336,325 443,824) 2,780,149)		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This may differ from the time-weighted rate of return. Development of investment return follows Pension Review Board procedure.

## Section 5.2: DESCRIPTION OF ASSETS

1.	Cash and Cash Equivalents	<b>M</b> \$	<b>arket Value</b> 615,256
2.	Equities		17,681,736
3.	Fixed Income a. Corporate Obligations b. Government Obligations		10,713,443 0
2.	Real Estate		619,582
2.	Other Investments		580,350
4.	Trust Asset Balance at 12/31/2015	\$	30,210,367
5.	Accrued Income		94
6.	Contribution Receivable		0
7.	Total Assets at 12/31/2015	\$	30,210,461

## Section 6: ACTUARIAL GAINS AND LOSSES

An important part of the changes in unfunded actuarial accrued liability from year to year is due to the impact of actuarial gains and losses of the Plan.

- Section 6.1: Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability
- Section 6.2: Actuarial Gain or Loss as of December 31, 2015
- Section 6.3: Schedule of Funding Progress
- Section 6.4: Projection of Estimated Benefit Payments

## Section 6.1: UNFUNDED ACTUARIAL ACCRUED LIABILITY

		Jar	nuary 1, 2016	Jar	nuary 1, 2015
<b>Actı</b> 1.	uarial Accrued Liability Active participants	\$	12,890,714	\$	13,530,275
2.	Deferred vested participants		4,960,537		4,834,996
3.	Retirees & Beneficiaries		15,679,619		13,530,138
4.	Total	\$	33,530,870	\$	31,895,409
<b>Actı</b> 5.	uarial Asset Value AAV	\$	30,210,461	\$	31,162,434
<b>Unf</b> i 6.	unded Actuarial Accrued Liability UAAL (4 – 5)	\$	3,320,409	\$	732,975

## Section 6.2: ACTUARIAL GAIN / (LOSS) AS OF DECEMBER 31, 2015

<b>Calo</b> 1.	culation of Total Actuarial Gain / (Loss) Unfunded actuarial accrued liability (UAAL) as of 1/1/2015	\$	732,975
2.	Normal cost as of January 1, 2015		876,806
3.	Actual contributions for 2015		(985,175)
4.	Interest at rate of 7.5% for year ending 12/31/2015 a. On UAAL b. On normal cost c. On contributions d. Total		54,973 65,760 (60,511) 60,222
5.	Increase due to plan amendment		115,478
5.	Expected UAAL (1 + 2 + 3 + 4d + 5)		800,306
6.	Actual UAAL		3,320,409
7.	Actuarial gain/(loss) for the year $(5-6)$	(\$	2,520,103)
<b>Sou</b> 8.	<b>rce of Gains / (Losses)</b> Due to experience during the year a. Asset experience b. Liability experience		(2,780,149) 260,046
9.	Due to actuarial assumption change		N/A
10.	Due to plan amendment		(115,478)
11.	Adjustment due to overfunding		
12.	Total gain/(loss) for the year (8a + 8b + 9 + 10 + 11)	(\$	2,635,581)

Plan Year Beginning January 1	Net Assets Available for Benefits	Actuarial Accrued Liability (AAL)	Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability (UAAL)	Percent Funded
2000	\$10,886,734	\$13,579,715	\$2,692,981	80.2%
2001	10,665,029	12,095,483	1,430,454	88.2%
2002	10,176,468	10,448,503	272,035	97.4%
2003	9,495,065	11,978,973	2,483,908	79.3%
2004	11,453,426	12,488,748	1,035,322	91.7%
2005	12,996,121	14,027,843	1,031,722	92.6%
2006	15,047,251	15,076,504	29,253	99.8%
2007	17,064,846	16,686,030	0	102.3%
2008	18,514,359	18,587,028	72,669	99.6%
2009	13,297,998	20,416,886	7,118,888	65.1%
2010	17,913,932	22,390,777	4,476,845	80.0%
2011	21,547,889	23,682,639	2,134,740	91.0%
2012	21,791,159	25,576,425	3,785,266	85.2%
2013	25,566,845	27,944,142	2,377,297	91.5%
2014	29,617,120	29,016,953	0	102.1%
2015	31,162,434	31,895,409	732,975	97.7%
2016	30,210,461	33,530,870	3,320,409	90.1%

## Section 6.3: SCHEDULE OF FUNDING PROGRESS

## Section 6.3: PROJECTION OF ESTIMATED BENEFIT PAYMENTS

Year	Estimated Benefit Payments
2016	1,773,000
2017	1,888,000
2018	1,963,000
2019	2,081,000
2020	2,169,000
2021	2,355,000
2022	2,462,000
2023	2,648,000
2024	2,845,000
2025	2,989,000
2026	3,254,000
2027	3,328,000
2028	3,412,000
2029	3,553,000
2030	3,609,000
2031	3,644,000
2032	3,656,000
2033	3,653,000
2034	3,779,000
2035	3,807,000
2036	4,102,000
2037	4,214,000
2038	4,159,000
2039	4,158,000
2040	4,166,000
2041	4,201,000
2042	4,300,000
2043	4,273,000
2044	4,215,000
2045	4,226,000

#### Section 7: GASB Nos. 67 AND 68 DISCLOSURE

The Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GASB) has issued statement No. 67 which provides the manner in which the actuarial condition of a public sector retirement plan is to be disclosed. GASB Statement No. 68 governs retirement plan reporting for public sector employers.

Assets used for GASB No. 67 disclosure are based on the actuarial value which is also equal to market value for the RTA Employees' Defined Benefit Trust. Plan liabilities are based on entry age normal cost funding method as required by GASB No. 67.

- Section 7.2 Schedule of contributions
- Section 7.3 Calculation of discount rate
- Section 7.4 Sensitivity of net pension liability to changes in discount rate
- Section 7.5 Changes in net pension liability
- Section 7.6 Deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources
- **Section 7.7** Notes to required supplementary information

## Section 7.1: SCHEDULE OF CHANGES IN THE NET PENSION LIABILITY AND RELATED RATIOS (as required by GASB No. 67)

	2015	2014
Total pension liability		
Service cost	\$876,806	\$695,517
Interest	2,396,547	2,254,995
Changes of benefit terms	115,478	391,915
Differences between expected and actual	(260,046)	784,295
experience		
Changes of assumptions	-	-
Benefit payments	(1,493,324)	(1,248,266)
Net change in total pension liability	\$1,635,461	\$2,878,456
Total pension liability – beginning	31,895,409	29,016,953
Total pension liability – ending (a)	\$33,530,870	\$31,895,409
Plan fiduciary net position		
Contributions – employer	\$985,175	\$1,178,498
Contributions – employee	-	-
Net investment income	(348,950)	1,706,547
Benefit payments	(1,493,324)	(1,248,266)
Administrative expense	(94,874)	(91,465)
Other	-	
Net change in plan fiduciary net position	(\$951,973)	\$1,545,314
	04 400 404	00 047 400
Plan fiduciary net position – beginning	31,162,434	29,617,120
Plan fiduciary net position – ending (b)	\$30,210,461	\$31,162,434
Net pension liability – ending (a) – (b)	\$3,320,409	\$732,975
Net pension hability – ending $(a) - (b)$	φ <u>3</u> ,320,409	φ132,915
Plan fiduciary net position as a		
percentage of the total pension liability	90.10%	97.70%
Provide and the second because and the		2
Covered-employee payroll	\$8,818,232	\$7,274,172
Net pension liability as a percentage of		
covered-employee payroll	37.65%	10.08%

# Section 7.2: SCHEDULE OF CONTRIBUTIONS (as required by GASB No. 67)

	2015	2014
Actuarially determined contribution Contributions in relation to the actuarially	\$983,696	\$695,517
determined contribution	985,175	\$1,178,498
Contribution deficiency (excess)	(\$1,479)	(\$482,981)
Covered-employee payroll	\$8,818,232	\$7,274,172
Contributions as a percentage of covered- employee payroll	11.17%	16.20%

# Section 7.3: CALCULATION OF THE DISCOUNT RATE (as required by GASB No. 67)

Pursuant to Paragraph 43, an alternate analysis is performed to compare the plan's net fiduciary position to projected benefit payments.

- 1. The Normal Cost represents the annual cost of benefit payments arising from future service increases for active employees.
- 2. The Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability represents the accumulated deficiency of the total cost of benefit payments which have already been earned over the current assets held by the plan's trust.
- 3. RTA's contribution policy is to make an annual payment equal to the Normal Cost plus the amortization payment of the Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability. The amortization payment is calculated as a level dollar amount over a period of 15 years from January 1, 2009.
- 4. A review of actual contributions over the past five years shows that RTA has made sufficient contributions to meet its funding policy.

On the basis of the above, the projected cash flows will be sufficient to provide the benefit payments to the plan participants. Thus, the Discount Rate is equal to the long-term expected rate of return of 7.5%.

## Section 7.4: SENSITIVITY OF NET PENSION LIABILITY TO CHANGES IN DISCOUNT RATE (as required by GASB No. 67)

The following presents the net pension liability, calculated using the discount rate of 7.5%, as well as what the net pension liability would be if it were calculated using a discount rate that is 1-percentage-point lower (6.5%) or 1-percentage-point higher (8.5%) than the current rate:

	1% Decrease (6.5%)	Current Discount Rate (7.5%)	1% Increase (8.5%)
Net pension liability	\$7,338,602	\$3,320,409	(\$57,330)

## Section 7.5: CHANGES IN NET PENSION LIABILITY (as required by GASB No. 68)

	Total Pension Liability (a)	Plan Fiduciary Net Position (b)	Net Pension Liability (a) – (b)
Balances at 12/31/2014	\$31,895,409	\$31,162,434	\$732,975
Changes for the year:			
Service cost	\$876,806		\$876,806
Interest	2,396,547		2,396,547
Differences between expected and			
actual experience	(260,046)		(260,046)
Changes in benefit terms	115,478		<u></u> 115,478
Contributions – employer		985,175	(985,175)
Contributions – employee		-	-
Net investment income		(348,950)	348,950
Benefit payments	(1,493,324)	(1,493,324)	-
Administrative expense		(94,874)	94,874
Other changes	-	-	-
Net changes	1,635,461	(951,973)	2,587,434
Balances as of 12/31/2015	\$33,530,870	\$30,210,461	\$3,320,409

## Section 7.6: DEFERRED OUTFLOWS OF RESOURCES AND DEFERRED INFLOWS OF RESOURCES (as required by GASB No. 68)

	Deferred Outflows of Resources	Deferred Inflows of Resources
Difference between expected and actual		
experience	\$-	\$260,046
Changes of assumptions	-	-
Changes in benefit terms	115,478	-
Net difference between projected and actual		
earnings on pension plan investments	2,780,149	-
-		
Total	\$2,895,627	\$260,044

Amounts reported as deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources related to pension will be recognized in pension expense as follows:

Year ended 12/31		
2016	\$459,871	41,299
2017	459,871	41,299
2018	459,871	41,299
2019	459,871	41,299
2020	459,871	41,299
Thereafter	596,272	53,549

## Section 7.7: NOTES TO REQUIRED SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION

The information presented in the required supplementary schedules was determined as part of the actuarial valuations at the dates indicated. Additional information as of the latest actuarial valuation follows:

Valua	tion date	January 1
Actua	rial cost method	Entry Age Normal
Amort	tization method	Level dollar amount over 15 years from January 1, 2009
Asset	valuation method	Market value
Actua	rial assumptions:	
	Investment rate of return	7.5%

## Section 8. SUMMARY AND CLOSING COMMENTS

It is our opinion that the results of this valuation provide a reasonable reflection of the funding status of the Plan and that the RTA Employees' Defined Benefit Plan & Trust is actuarially sound provided RTA contribute the annual contribution amount to the trust.

Type of Entity:	Local Government
Plan Provisions	
Effective Date:	July 21, 1986
Employee:	Any person, excluding independent contractors, receiving remuneration for personal services rendered to the Employer.
Employer:	Corpus Christi Regional Transportation Authority
Plan Year:	January 1 to December 31.
Participation:	Commencement of full-time employment or reemployment.
Employee Contributions:	None required or permitted.
Compensation:	W-2 wages paid during a calendar year and any employee salary reduction under Code §125, §457 or §414(h).
Average Compensation:	Three year average of Compensation.
Accrued Benefit:	2% of average monthly compensation multiplied by total years of service. Service prior to 7/21/1986 is excluded.
Normal Form:	Joint and 50% survivor annuity for married participants. Single life annuity for single participants.
Actuarial Equivalence:	
Interest:	7.0%
Mortality:	1984 Unisex Mortality Table
Lump Sum Payments:	
Interest:	7.0%
Mortality:	1984 Unisex Mortality Table
Normal Retirement:	
Eligibility:	First of month after attaining age 62.
Benefit:	Accrued Benefit.

Early Retirement:	
Eligibility:	First of the month after attaining age 55 and completion of 10 years of service.
Benefit:	Accrued Benefit reduced 5% per each year commencement precedes Normal Retirement Date.
Special Early Retirement:	
Eligibility:	As of December 31, 2014, between ages 55 and 62, and completion of 10 years of service. Employee must elect Special Early Retirement by January 31, 2015.
Benefit:	Accrued Benefit payable beginning February 1, 2015.
Special Early Retirement:	
Eligibility:	As of December 31, 2012, between ages 55 and 62, and completion of 10 years of service. Employee must elect Special Early Retirement by February 28, 2013.
Benefit:	Accrued Benefit payable beginning March 1, 2013.
Death Benefits:	
Eligibility:	Death after completion of three years of service.
Benefit:	Qualified Pre-retirement Survivors Annuity.
Termination benefit:	
Vesting percent:	According to the following schedule:
	Years of service         Vested percent           Under 3         0%           3         20%           4         40%           5         60%           6         80%           7+         100%
Benefit:	Accrued benefit multiplied by the Vested Percent.
Cost-of-living adjustment:	
Eligibility:	Participants receiving monthly retirement benefits at January 1, 2016
Benefit:	Five percent (5%) for those whose benefits began as of January 1, 2005, and Two percent (2%) for those whose benefits began

## **PensionBenefits**